Case 2:11-cv-03603-WFK-ARL Document 28 Filed 10/22/12 Page 1 of 23 PageID #: 207

BRESSLER, AMERY&ROSS

A PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

P.O. Box 1980 • Morristown, NJ 07962

Hand Delivery:

325 Columbia Turnpike • Suite 301 • Florham Park, NJ 07932

973.514.1200 • fax 973.514.1660

www.bressler.com

Jed L. Marcus Mmber direct: 973-966-9678 jmarcus@bressler.com

October 22, 2012

By ECF Only

COURTESY COPY TO COURT

Honorable Arlene R. Lindsay, U.S.M.J. United States District Court Eastern District of New York Long Island Federal Courthouse 814 Federal Plaza Central Islip, New York 11722-4451

Re: Siewharack v. Queens Long Island Medical Group, P.C. Civil Action No. 11-cv-3603

Dear Judge Lindsay:

This firm represents Defendant Queens Long Island Medical Group, P.C. ("QLIMG") in the above-referenced matter, which opposes Plaintiff's motion for expedited discovery and in support of QLIMG's request for an extension of discovery. Plaintiff, after consultation with us, refused to consent to our request for an extension of discovery.

On October 18, 2012, Plaintiff served QLIMG with a voluminous Third Demand for Documents, demanding an expedited fifteen (15) day response time while simultaneously filing her motion without conferring with QLIMG's counsel. Plaintiff's motion should be denied. First, expedited discovery as to QLIMG's corporate condition is completely premature and irrelevant. See CSC Consulting, Inc. v. Aluminum.com, Inc., 2001 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 6686, *3-4 (S.D.N.Y. 2001) (merger discussions are not discoverable). Second, Plaintiff has not set forth any support for this allegation or identify the source of such information other than vague allegations. In fact, any information Plaintiff thinks she has was derived from confidential mediation sessions, which Plaintiff has either mischaracterized or misunderstood. Third, Plaintiff is not entitled to such discovery before conditional certification. "During the pre-certification stage of a collective action under the FLSA, discovery is limited to issues of certification." Charles v. Nationwide Mut. Ins. Co., 2010 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 143487, 9 (E.D.N.Y. 2010).

QLIMG's request for a discovery extension should be granted. Plaintiff refuses to identify individuals that she believes are similarly-situated, other than seven (7) individuals all from Jamaica Estates. (See Plaintiff's Second Request for Production of Documents, redacted to protect the privacy of non-parties, attached as <u>Exhibit 1</u>.) When we demanded that Plaintiff identify them, she refused until, on October 17, 2012, her counsel simply produced a list

BRESSLER, AMERY& ROSS

October 22, 2012 Page 2

containing the names 595 union members obtained from Local 1199. (See Plaintiff's redacted Supplemental Responses to Defendant's Interrogatories attached as Exhibit 2.) Yet, as late as October 12, 2012, Mr. Shalov told me that he has no statements, certified or otherwise. This list is nonsense; it is a bad faith response to our reasonable demands and Plaintiff's obligations under the FLSA. Plaintiff has also failed to identify any policy, plan or procedure by QLIMG in support of her claims or established that she was not paid for time actually worked. At most, Plaintiff has a single individual claim; hardly enough to concern this Court with allegations that OLIMG will be unable to satisfy a judgment. ¹

QLIMG has previously consented to Plaintiff's numerous requests to extend discovery until October 5, 2012 and December 5, 2012. It agreed to these extensions, anticipating Plaintiff's motion for conditional certification, which Plaintiff never filed. Instead, Plaintiff has purposefully delayed filing for FLSA conditional certification or New York Rule 23 class certification for over one year in an attempt to "wait out" the clock. Plaintiff has also informed us that she plans to file for conditional certification on or before the dispositive motion deadline of December 19, 2012. Mr. Shalov admitted to this office that denying QLIMG the opportunity to conduct class discovery and file its motion for decertification was his strategy all along. Of course, the only deadline left is that for dispositive motions, which a motion for initial collective action certification surely is not. Gortat v. Capala Bros., 2010 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 35451, *27 (E.D.N.Y. 2010)("A motion to authorize a collective action is [] a non-dispositive action.").

The Court should not reward Plaintiff's dilatory tactics. The deadline to amend the pleadings to add additional parties expired on April 4, 2012. Plaintiff's pattern of delay in pursuing conditional certification has delayed the notice period, the identification of opt-in plaintiffs and class discovery. See Gortat, 2010 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 35451, *32 (quoting Valcho v. Dallas County Hosp. Dist., 574 F. Supp. 2d 618, 621 (N.D. Tex. 2008) ("[T]he court reexamines the class after notice, time for opting in, and discovery has taken place.") (emphasis added); Laroque v. Domino's Pizza, LLC, 557 F. Supp. 2d 346, 352 (E.D.N.Y. 2008) ("After discovery, a second inquiry begins, generally precipitated by a defendant's motion for decertification, in which the court examines with a greater degree of scrutiny whether the members of the plaintiff class -- including those who have opted in -- are similarly situated."). Because of Plaintiff's delaying tactics, QLIMG has only had the opportunity to conduct discovery as to the named plaintiff despite the December 5, 2012 deadline for discovery quickly approaching. As such, Plaintiff's argument that QLIMG had an opportunity to conduct class discovery is a fabrication.

¹ At the outset of this case, QLIMG asserted that this litigation was subject to a collective bargaining agreement and thus Plaintiff was required to submit her claims to arbitration. Plaintiff therefore agreed to limit her claims to that of overtime for hours worked in excess of forty (40) and filed an Amended Complaint. (a copy of Mr. Ginsberg's letter is attached as Exhibit 3.) However, QLIMG has now been put on notice of Plaintiff's new allegations involving lunch breaks and unpaid compensation. Given the substantive change and divergence from the original allegations in the Complaint, QLIMG has placed Plaintiff on notice that it will file a motion to dismiss and compel arbitration absent withdrawal.

BRESSLER, AMERY& ROSS

October 22, 2012 Page 3

Plaintiff should be barred from filing for conditional certification and proceed on an individual basis. *Parker v. Columbia Pictures Indus.*, 204 F.3d 326, 340 (2d Cir. 2000) (refusing to find good cause where party received notice long in advance of the deadline that the complaint did not name all necessary parties); *Holmes v. Grubman*, 568 F.3d 329, 335 (2d Cir. N.Y. 2009) (affirming denial of leave to amend outside a scheduling order deadline because plaintiff could not show diligence when he failed to raise the relevant facts in any prior pleadings or motion practice).

Should this Court allow Plaintiff to file a motion for preliminary certification well outside the Scheduling Order deadline of April 4, 2012, however, QLIMG cannot reasonably meet the December 5, 2012 discovery deadline for the purposes of class discovery. Indeed, Defendant will not even know whether this case will proceed on a class-wide basis before December 5, 2012 as Plaintiff has refused to file a motion for preliminary certification. This situation clearly establishes "good cause" to extend discovery consistent with Fed. R. Civ. P. 16(b)(4). See Enzymotec Ltd. v. NBTY, Inc., 754 F. Supp. 2d 527, 536 (E.D.N.Y. 2010)("To satisfy the good cause standard 'the party must show that, despite its having exercised diligence, the applicable deadline could not have been reasonably met.'"). QLIMG has invited Plaintiff to file a motion for conditional certification several times, but Plaintiff's refusal to do so for tactical reasons has necessitated QLIMG to request this extension.

If the discovery deadline expired before potential opt-in Plaintiffs were even identified – let alone whether they opted-in after notice – QLIMG would be highly prejudiced. QLIMG must have the opportunity to analyze the merits of opt-in Plaintiffs' allegations and determine whether they are similarly situated. Indeed, the Court has a similar obligation in the second stage of the collective action certification process. *Myers v. Hertz Corp.*, 624 F.3d 537, 555 (2d Cir. 2010 ("At the second stage, the district court will, on a fuller record, determine whether a so-called "collective action" may go forward by determining whether the plaintiffs who have opted in are in fact "similarly situated" to the named plaintiffs. The action may be "de-certified" if the record reveals that they are not, and the opt-in plaintiffs' claims may be dismissed without prejudice."). Without class discovery, the Court would be unable to perform this second stage analysis.

Based upon the foregoing, should Plaintiff ever file – and have granted – a motion for conditional certification, QLIMG requests additional time to conduct class discovery from the time plaintiffs' opt-in period closes. Although discovery could be shorter, QLIMG does not yet know the size of the potential class. Accordingly, QLIMG has attached a proposed Scheduling Order for the Court's consideration, which specifically sets forth deadlines to ensure that this matter proceeds in a fair and just manner.

Respectfully submitted.

Jed L. Marc

pc: Lee S. Shalov, Esq. (by ECF)

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	V
KARMA SIEWHARACK on behalf of herself and all other similarly situated employees,	: :
Plaintiff,	: Civil Action No. 11-cv-3603 (WFK)(ARL) :
v.	· :
QUEENS LONG ISLAND MEDICAL GROUP, P.C.,	· : :
Defendant.	: : V

LINDSAY, Magistrate Judge:

The Scheduling Order in this action dated September 11, 2012 is hereby amended as follows:

December 18, 2012: Deadline for Plaintiff to file a motion for initial certification.

Defendant shall have forty-five (45) days from the date Plaintiff

files her motion to file its opposition.

October 4, 2013: Deadline to conduct class discovery.

November 4, 2013: Deadline to file motion for decertification.

December 4, 2013: Deadline to file final motion for certification.

February 1, 2014: Final conference before the undersigned at 11:30 a.m. Meaningful

settlement discussions will occur at the conference. Clients or other persons with full settlement authority must be available by telephone. Parties are to electronically file a joint proposed pretrial order in compliance with the district judge's individual rules,

signed by counsel for each party, prior to the conference.

Dated: Central Islip, New York	SO ORDERED:
, 2012	
	ARLENE ROSARIO LINDSAY
	United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT 1

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

KARMA SIEWHARACK, on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated.

Index No. 2:11-cv-03603-LDW-ARL

Plaintiff.

٧.

QUEENS LONG ISLAND MEDICAL GROUP P.C.

Defendant.

PLAINTIFF'S SECOND REQUEST FOR THE PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that pursuant to Rules 26, 33, and 34 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and Local Civil Rule 33.3 of the United States District Court for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York, the above named Plaintiff hereby requests Defendant QLIMG to produce the documents requested herein for inspection and copying no later than thirty (30) days from the date of service hereof, at the offices of McLaughlin & Stern, LLP, 260 Madison Ave., New York, NY 10016, segregated to reflect the request pursuant to which the documents are being produced, and in accordance with the following definitions and instructions.

INSTRUCTIONS

- 1. If any document otherwise required to be produced in response to these interrogatories is withheld from production, the defendant shall, nevertheless, identify each such document stating as to each (i) the type of document; (ii) general subject matter; (iii) date of the document; (vi) author(s), addresses(s), and recipient(s), and if different, its signatory or signatories and the date and place of its preparation; and, (v) the specific basis upon which the document is withheld, including but not limited to whether the attorney-client privilege is claimed.
- 2. This request is continuing in nature and requires further and supplemental production if additional information or documents responsive hereto are discovered between the time of the initial production hereunder and the time of hearing and trial of this action.
- 3. If you object to any question or request or part of an item or category, the objection and part objected to shall be specified in accord with Rules 26 and 34 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the Local Civil Rules of the United States District



Court for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York, and within the time limits set forth in those Rules.

DOCUMENT REQUESTS

reports for the following current of	resent, the pay statements and timecard records and/or former employees of Defendant: (A) (B) (F)
Dated: April 25, 2012 New York, New York	Cue X Abrilo
	Lee S. Shalov, Esq. (LS-7118)
	McLAUGHLIN & STERN, LLP
	260 Madison Avenue
	New York, NY 10016
	212-448-1100
	Louis Ginsberg, Esq. (LG-1048)
	Matthew Cohen, Esq. (MC-2595)
	LAW FIRM OF LOUIS GINSBERG, P.C.
	1613 Northern Blvd.
	Roslyn, New York 11576
	Telephone: (516) 625-0105 X.13
	lg@louisginsberglawoffices.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff, the FLSA Collective

Class, and the New York Class

EXHIBIT 2

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

KARMA SIEWHARACK, on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated,

Index No. 2:11-cv-03603-WFK-ARL

Plaintiff.

٧.

QUEENS LONG ISLAND MEDICAL GROUP, P.C.

Defendant.

PLAINTIFF'S SUPPLEMENTAL RESPONSES TO <u>DEFENDANT'S INTERROGATORIES</u>

6. Please identify every former or current employee of QLIMC that you claim are "similarly situated" as described in your complaint [sic].

Plaintiff objects to this request because it seeks attorney work product, is overbroad, unduly burdensome, vague and not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence. Subject to and without waiving such objections, some of the former or current employees of Queens Long Island Medical Group, P.C. that are "similarly situated" to Plaintiff are identified in Exhibit A attached hereto.

Dated: October 17, 2012 New York, New York

Lee S. Shalov, Esq. (LS-7118) McLAUGHLIN & STERN, LLP 260 Madison Avenue

New York, NY 10016 212-448-1100

Louis Ginsberg, Esq. (LG-1048)
Matthew Cohen, Esq. (MC-2595)
LAW FIRM OF LOUIS GINSBERG, P.C.
1613 Northern Blvd.
Roslyn, New York 11576
Telephone: (516) 625-0105 X.13
lg@louisginsberglawoffices.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff, the FLSA Collective Class, and the New York Class



33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 40 40 40 40 40 40 40 40 40 40 40 40	Color Colo
	ODEPHONE
ASSISSISSISSISSISSISSISSISSISSISSISSISSI	ASSOCIATION OF THE PROPERTY OF
377/1986 377/1986 377/1980 19/22/1980 19/22/1980 19/22/1980 19/22/1980 10/17/1980	X
7-0-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-	M N N OURLY HOMEDEPARTMEN 7 11 Assona-Mercy 5 Institute 18 77 Assona-Famy Medic 18 77 Assona-Famy Medic 18 77 Assona-Famy Medic 17 14 Assona-Famy Medic 17 15 Assona-Famy Medic 17 16 Assona-Famy Medic 17 17 Assona-Famy Medic 17 18 Assona-Famy Medic 18 77 Assona-Medical Recq 18 77 Assona-Medical Recq 18 78 Assona-Medical Recq 18 78 Assona-Operations 18 78 Assona-Ope

59 /	58 58	56	UT UT UT	53	52	50	49	47	46	45	44	42	41	40	308	37	33 00	34	33	33	30	29	78	26	25	23	22	21	19	18	17	15	14	13	3	10	ယ္စြဲ၀		တ	5	4	
																																										, XIII
MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST	NITED ACCU	CLERK	SWTCHBRO	OC BRX	OI BOX	1	CLERK	OLERX	MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST		MED ASS	MED ASST	CLERK	CLERX	CLERK	CLERK	SWTCHBRD	CLERK	CLERK	OLE AX	MED ASST	MED ASST	CLERK	O LEIRX	CLERK	CLERK	LAB TECH	MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST	CLERK	VED ASST	VED ASST	TSSA CEM
3/18/2002 35		7/11/2002 35 7/5/1994 35	6/26/1995 35		- -	-	-	- }	5/30/2006 35		!		7/11/2005			10/11/2005 35	1	16/20/2003 35	2/7/1982 35	<u> </u>		9/6/2005	35		8/13/2001 35	- -	10/17/2003 35	-		.	-	22	10/31/2005 35	: :		2	2/29/1988 35			ن د	2/5/1990 3	2/14/2005 35
17 11	-	17.11	17 11 17 11	17.11	18.18		, ,		İ	1		16.72	16 72	20.05		17 17		17 11	18.26	16.72	16.72	16 77	์ รี. ฮี	1	!	1	1610			5 -7.08 /	16 72	16	5 6 72	, 1 1 1	1	17.28	35 -7 -6		1.6.72	5 (8 77	5 17.16	5 17 44
norst-Family Med	Elmhurst Ped Pediali	Elmhurst Ped Pediat	Elmhurst Ped Optom	Elinhuist Ped-Optom	Elmhurst Ped-Ophtha			- :	Elmhurst Ped-Operat	1		- 1	Elmhurst Ped-Medica		m.	Fighurs: Ped-Far N	Asion - into	Asiona-Pediatrics ()	Astonia-Pediatrics	Astona-Operations-S	Astona-Operations-S	Asiona-Operations of	Aslona-Operations-S	Astona-Operations-S	16.72 Asiona-Operations-S	Astona Operations				Asiona-Medical Reco	Aslone-Medical	. 1	Astona-Madical Reco			i	Asiona-Family Medici	Astona-Family Medic	Astoria Family Medici	Asiona-Family Medic	- 1	Astonia Allengy & Imm

5.6 5.6 5.6 5.6 5.6 5.6 5.6 5.6	62 63 64	60 B C D
		E
MED ASST MED AS	WED VERNINGO	I O H I O I
IN SIGN STORY TO THE REPORT OF	n - 9 2 3	
17.11 Elmhurst. F. 17.12 Elmhurst. F. 17.13 Elmhurst. F. 17.14 Elmhurst. F. 17.15 Elmhurst. F. 17.16 Elmhurs	11 Cimbust-Family 28 Embust-Family 11 Embust-Family 72 Embust-Family 72 Embust-Family	7 11 Elmhurst-Family

1777 h	178	17.4	173	177	170 F	160	1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	188	165	164	163	161	180	150	157	156	155		152	151	150	146	147	146	144	143	142	140	139	1 3	136	135	134	132	131	130	128	127	126	124	123	. 22	
MR CLERK	CLERK	CLERK	MR CLERK	CLERK	XRAYROPT	BECEBI	MED ASST	ביי	MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST	CPN	1 E		No Or nov	RECEPT	MED ASST	ע ע ע ע	MR CLERK	RECEPT	MR OLERX	OLERX	CLERK	RECEPT	SWTCHBRD	RECEPT	RECEDT.	TRNSCRPT	RECEPT	RECEPT	CLERK	MED ASST	MED ACCT	CLERK	CLERK	MR CLERK	OLEAN S.K. CLEAN	MED ASST	MED ASST	MED ASST	
6/26/1996	10/17/2005	9/19/2005	6/2/1981		3/20/1989	6/29/2000	3/14/2005	2/3/1992	7/5/2006	7/18/1988	4/25/2005	7/25/2005	2/17/2002	5/6/1991	6/2/1986		3/6/2006	10/23/2006	7/15/1993	6/16/2003	1/20/1988	4/10/1989	10/1/1990	10/17/2005	10/10/2005	11/8/1976	- 16/18/1973	~	5/14/1997	7/10/1991	11/21/1994	12/5/1988	2/18/2006	9/9/1982	5/16/1086	2/13/2006	10/23/2006	6/28/1988	9/19/1994	11/29/1988	7/31/2006	1/19/2002	
35	35	၂ ၂ ၂	35	35	35	35	ر ائ	35	35 2	3. 35	35	აგ	3 5	35	35	35	35.4	35	35	ر ارز ارز	35	35	35	35	35	35		35	3 3	35	35	ر ا ا	35	13.5	3.05	13	35	35	ر ري	35	35	ي اد	,
16 97	. 1	6 6	7.84	17.84	7 8 7	19.28	16 45	20.41	16.25	18 23		16.45	22.0			1			18.23	20.17	17.84	17.84		16.08	16 08	17 84	18 23	16.08	16 23	18.62	17 42	15.81	16.08	18.23	80.08	16.08	16 08	17 84	15 08	18.23	16.45	6 45 6 45	
Firshing South-Med.	Flushing South-Medi	Flushing Soulh-Med	Flushing South-Med	Flushing South-Med	Flushing South-Labo	Flushing South-Labo	Flushing		Flushing South-Fami	Flushing			Flushing South-Cardi		Flushing South-Card	Flushing North-Radio		Flushing North-Physi	Flushing North-Pedia	lyshing	lushing	Surven		gn reula	Flushing	Flushing Nodh-Oper	Flushing	Flushing North-Open	Flushing	Flushing	42 Flushing North-Open	Flushing North-Oper		Flushing North-Obsta	Flushing North-Med	Flushing	1	- 1	Flushing North-Labor		i i	Flushing North-Gastr	

200 200 200 200 200 200 200 200 200 200	1778 1877 1887 1887 1887 1887 1888 1988 19
	c
	O
	m
	תר ורי
	a
	ı ı
	NED
MED ASST MED	MED ASST MED ASST MED ASST MED ASST MED ASST MED ASST MED ASST MED ASST MED ASST MED ASST
E//5/(987 4/17/1995 4/17/1995 4/17/1995 1/15/1995 1/15/1995 1/15/1996 1/16/1998	## RIPSTOON RIPSTOON
6/5/987 4/7/986 4/7/986 4/7/986 10/7/988	K 89/1986 2/25/1991 10015/1985 10015/1985 123/2004 123/2004 123/2005 1/21/2005
100 N : 00 N : N : N : N : N : N : S : S : S : S :	1 6 6 7 6 6 7 6 6 7 6 7 6 7 7 7 7 7 7 7
Forest Hills - Gandiolo Forest Hills - Farmily A Forest Hills - Farmily	Flushing South-Ope Flushing South-Pedi Flushing South-Raddiplushing South-Rad
Forest Hills-Cardiology Forest Hills-Cardiology Forest Hills-Cardiology Forest Hills-Cardiology Forest Hills-Cardiology Forest Hills-Family M Forest Hills-Gastroen Forest Hills-Madical Forest Hills-Medical Forest Hill	Flushing South-Oper Flushing South-Padid Flushing South-Radid Flushing Flushing South-Radid Flushing Flushing

282 283 285 286 287 288 288 288 291 291 291 293	C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C	
MED ASST MED ASST	MED ASST MED AS	
1/12/2003 35 14/18/2005 35 14/18/2005 35 3/14/2005 35 3/14/2005 35 8/23/2007 35 3/12/2007 35 3/12/2007 35 1/12/2005 35 1/1	8:52:002 17:26:002 17:26:003 17:27:2005 17:27:27:2005 17:27:27:2005 17:27:27:2005 17:27:27:27:27:27:27:27:2	
In Jamaica Estates-Far 17.11 Jamaica Estates-Far	M. N.	

	298 298 298 298	
MED ASST MED AS	MED ASSI	
	2/12/2007 2/14/2005 3/31/1978	
6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6	35	-
277 77 78 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6	50 T	
	Lamaica Estates Cam Lamaica Estates Fam Lamaica Estates Fam	

/ USES SEE SEE SEE SEE SEE SEE SEE SEE SE	
	В
	C
	0
	m
	מד
	G
	н
	-
MED ASST MED	12.
1,12,12,005 1,12,12,105 1,12,12,12,105 1,12,12,105 1,12,12,105 1,12,12,105 1,12,12,105	X
	٦٢
10 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	7 7
Lamaica calla la	
The beautiful to the control of the	

453 453 456 457 459 460 461 462 463 466 466 466 466 467 468 468 469 472	A110 A110 A110 A110 A110 A110 A110 A110
AED ASST AED AED AED AED AED AED AED AED AED AED	MED ASST WED AS
(6)	X 4442005 8472000 77262000 77262000 77262000 77262000 84762000
77.77.77.77.77.77.77.77.77.77.77.77.77.	7.16.6 1.7.2
Rego Park Obigyn Rego Park Obigerion Rego Park Redology Park Redol	Queens Village-Fami Queens Village-Fami Queens Village-Fami Queens Village-Fami Queens Village-Fami Queens Village-Fami Queens Village-Laco Queens Village-Medi Queens Village-Medi Queens Village-Medi Queens Village-Medi Queens Village-Medi Queens Village-Medi Queens Village-Open Queens Village-Open Queens Village-Open Queens Village-Open Queens Village-Open Queens Village-Open Queens Village-Open Queens Village-Open Queens Village-Open Queens Village-Pedi Queens Village-Pedi

526 527 528 529 530 531	8 C D D C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C
OLERK CLERK OLERK OLERK OLERK	O H O CITAL MEDIASS TARED ASST MEDIAS TARED ASST MEDIASS TARED ASST MEDIAS TARED TAR
07.4/1954 10/22/1979 8/20/2005 8/20/2005 11/15/1993 11/12/2005	CC3 2005 CC3 2005 CC3 2005 CC3 2005 CC3 2006
17.08 Fichment Hill-Opera 19.15 Richment Hill-Opera 16.72 Richment Hill-Opera 18.57 Richment Hill-Opera 18.57 Richment Hill-Opera 17.06 Enterment Hill-Opera 17.06 Enterment Hill-Opera	5 6 7 7 7 7 8 8 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7

500 500 500 500 500 500 500 500 500 500	532 536 536 536 536	
		8
		0
		0
		m
		-
		F
		G
		Ι
		-
CLERK AED ASST AED	AED ASST	٦
	5/6/12/20 5/6/12	-
5/20/1963 12/22/1967 12/22/1967 1/6/2006 1/6/200	17/1/2025 17/5/2025 17/2/2025 5/16/2025 9/8/1992 5/6/1992	×
6. 6. 6. 6. 6. 6. 6. 6. 6. 6. 6. 6. 6. 6		
	5 6 7 7 7 7	Σ.
R. R	Richmond Hill- Richmond Hill- Richmond Hill- Richmond Hill- Richmond Hill- Richmond Hill-	
amily of the amily persons of the pe	무무무무품	Z
ESTACON COSE DE SOS SOS SOS SOS DE MANDE DE LA PROPERTIE DE LA		

1100SEIN 0206

606	605 5	2 2	3 6	3 2		9 C	2 8	200	507	200	1 G	280		9	
															ь,
															ဂ
															0
															_
															77
															G
															Ξ
MEO	MIII A		D C	CLE	Γ 2	CLE	CLERK	I.W.S.	XA	ÇAB	MED	NEO.	VED /	OWN	H
NED ASST	ASST	굦	2	R		ESK.	R	WICHBRD	MAINTNOE	AIDE	ASS	DASST	ASST	ASST	د ا
1	0.00	l ã	1	9		-		1	2	On Charles	6	1		3	
10/7/199	6/23/1937	3/29/2004	5/8/1978	6/27/2005	116/1936	0/3/2005	14/2006	4/9/1984	2/10/1992	8/8/2005	6/23/2003	4/23/1984	6/15/2003	3/10/1586	7
					,	ļ .				ļ		1			
35.5	မှ	35	i G	မ	<u>ئ</u> 5	35	35	<u>ن</u> ا	35	35	35	<u>ယ</u> ပါ	 မှ 	35	
17 11	17:	6.72	906	16 72	21.43	:6 72	16.72	13 19	16.28	15.39	j=7 ==	16.19	17 11	19 37	Ξ
17 11 Valley Stream-Urgen	7 11 Rockaway-Pediatric	Rockaway-Operation	9.08 Rockaway-Operation	Reckeway-Operation	Frockaway-Operatio:	6.72 Rockaway-Operation	6.72 Rockaway-Operation	3.19 Rockaway-Operation	16.28 Rockaway Operation	5.39 Rockeway-Laborator	7.11 Rockeway-Family M	8.19 Rockaway-Family M	11 Rockaway Family !!	937 Euchamay Family V	
tream-U	ay_Pedia	ay-Oper	ay-Oper	ay-Oper	ay-Open	ay-Oper	ay-Oper	ay-Oper	ay Oper	ay-Labo	a/·Facto	ay-Fami	ay Famo	ay-Fami	Z
0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00	trics	300	<u>بد</u> ن	a 10 -	ation.	ation.	alion.	2000	CON	rator	¥.	₹ 4.	¥	á	

EXHIBIT 3

09/26/2011 17 17 FAX

Ø1002/002

N 1613 NORTHERN BOXILEVARD
ROSLYN, NEW YOUR 11576
(516) 625-0105 (TEL.)
(516) 625-0106 (F.A.)
(Elèmissinshen) wolficce.com (E-Mail.)

233 BROADWAY - SUTTY 2220
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10279
(212) 406-3630 (TEL.)
(212) 406-3574 (FAX)
Inchesischerberbewolders.com (E-Hail)

PRACTICE LIMITED TO LABOR EMPLOYMENT LAW

Please direct all communications to our Roslyn office

LAW FIRM OF LOUIS GINSBERG, P.C.

September 26, 2011

VIA FAX
Jed L. Marcus, Esq.
Bressler, Amery & Ross
P.O. Box 1980
Morristown, New Jersey 07962

Re: Siewharack v. Queens Long Island Medical Group, PC

Dear Mr. Marcus:

We represent the Plaintiff as well as the putative collective and class members.

Pursuant to our conversation this afternoon, this is to confirm that the overtime claims in this case only seek compensation for hours worked in excess of forty(40) per week. Please confirm that you will be withdrawing your letter to the Court requesting a pre-motion conference in order to make a Motion to Dismiss.

Plaintiff as well as the putative collective and class members expressly reserve all of their other rights and claims.

Sincerely,

Louis Ginsberg, Esq. For the Law Firm of Louis Ginsberg, P.C.

cc: Lee Shalov, Esq.

